



Camps Bay City Improvement District Non-Profit Company

First Members' Meeting

Location	Camps Bay Primary School 11 Dunkeld Road, Camps Bay
Date	Wednesday 23 October 2024
CID NPC Directors in attendance	Spencer McNally (Chairperson) Louise Cooke (Deputy Chairperson) Richard Bendel (Treasurer) Gavin Reynolds Jonathan Tillett Kim Faclier Martin Steinau
CID Management in attendance	Muneeb Hendricks Ty Watts Kyle Visagie Sarah Meder
Apologies received	All of the NPC Directors were in attendance.

The following members gave apologies:

Shelley Trope  
Ursula Ehrentraut

The following members gave apologies and their proxy to another person:

Anthony Ayling  
Maree Brink  
Neville Chester  
Amanda Davis  
Keith Doig  
Tracy Droyman  
Friedrich Hans Esterhuyse  
Raymond Goss  
Peter Hunter

Michelle Joffe  
Wendy Jones  
Peter Leger  
Brendon Lezar  
Madge Lezar  
Gary Locketz  
Megan MacKenzie  
Ryan McNally  
Ian Merrington  
Lindie Novick  
Paul O'Donnell  
Carl Richter  
Melvyn Richter  
Aleksander Ruzicka  
Dorothy Sank  
Gereldine Seale  
Daniel Sherman  
Irving Solomon  
Jeffrey Solomon  
David Solomon  
Tanya Sternberg  
Jennifer van Papendorp  
Fredrich Scheele  
Chan Wan Keung William  
Wayne Coughlan  
Craig Delpport  
Shane Harrison  
Stephanie Hustwick  
Mohammed Zunaid Loghdey  
Lara Myerson  
Bernard Sellmeyer  
Eyal Shaked  
Maria Elizabeth Steinau  
Anton Velleman  
Roland Wood  
Anna Maria Fernau  
Gertruida Groenewald  
Thomas Mrozek  
Karl-Heinz Schafer

## 1. Welcome, Apologies and Attendance

- 1.1. The outgoing Chairperson, Spencer McNally, opened the meeting at 18:16 and welcomed all in attendance.
- 1.2. All attendees had been requested to sign the attendance register.
- 1.3. All outgoing Directors of the CID NPC were in attendance.
- 1.4. Formal apologies were received from 50 members, of whom 48 gave proxies to other attendees.
- 1.5. Attendance:
  - 1.5.1. Non-members who signed the register: 73
  - 1.5.2. Members (or their representatives or proxies) who signed the register: 89
  - 1.5.3. Total signed attendance: 162
  - 1.5.4. Estimated total attendance: 250

## 2. Membership

- 2.1. The Chairperson summarized the Company's membership rules as set out in the Memorandum of Incorporation (MOI).
- 2.2. Out of 3,038 eligible properties owned by approximately 2,400 distinct persons or entities, membership applications were received from 197 applicants, of which about a quarter were initially defective or incomplete.
- 2.3. CID Management followed up to seek correction of all defective or incomplete applications, after which only 8 remained defective or incomplete. One applicant was found to be ineligible due to receiving a rates rebate from the City.
- 2.4. Thereafter, as required by the MOI, the Board of Directors met on 22 October to approve 188 members by resolution of the Board.

## 3. Quorum

- 3.1. A quorum for the meeting requires 10% of the members in attendance.
- 3.2. By show of hands more than 19 members were in attendance.
- 3.3. At 18:22 the Chairperson declared the meeting quorate.

## 4. Chairperson's Presentation

- 4.1. The Chairperson began his presentation at 18:23.

#### 4.2. Significant topics covered included the following:

- 4.2.1. Brief overview of achievements to date and plans for the coming months.
- 4.2.2. Introduction to CID Management and the outgoing Board of Directors.
- 4.2.3. Director portfolios.
- 4.2.4. Overview of sub-committees of the Board, with the Cleansing, Maintenance, Landscaping & Upgrading Sub-Committee highlighted as an example.
- 4.2.5. Overview of overall governance structure and how it is explicitly designed for meaningful community involvement and for generating a pipeline of suitably qualified and committed future Directors for the CID.

### 5. CID Manager's Presentation

5.1. The CID Manager, Muneeb Hendricks, began his presentation at 18:48.

#### 5.2. Significant topics covered included the following:

- 5.2.1. Overview of Public Safety initiatives and partnerships with SAPS and City of Cape Town Law Enforcement.
- 5.2.2. SAPS statistics show marked reduction in reported crimes since the advent of the CID.
- 5.2.3. Law Enforcement statistics show significant increase in enforcement of the law in Camps Bay, including numerous warnings and fines, stop and searches, confiscations of weapons / drugs / alcohol, and several significant arrests.
- 5.2.4. Response to questions received in advance regarding Airbnb nuisance, inconsiderate builders and buskers on the strip.
- 5.2.5. Overview of Control Room and efforts made to support victims of crime, assist SAPS in investigation of crime and prosecution thereof, and gather intelligence to improve deterrence and prevention of future crime.
- 5.2.6. Overview of CID Operations, including cleansing, recycling, maintenance, landscaping, removal of alien vegetation and the integration of Social Development in these areas.
- 5.2.7. Successful collaboration with City of Cape Town to expedite the unblocking of drains, repairing of potholes, fixing of leaks, etc. Over 40 tons of rubbish removed from greenbelts and public spaces.
- 5.2.8. Numerous success stories in Social Development, including 30 formerly homeless persons assisted to reintegrate into society. Several of these people have entered the Ignisive learnership programme that is now part of the CID's Social Development efforts and two have since gone on to permanent formal employment with the CID's cleansing service provider.
- 5.2.9. Ongoing communication with the neighbourhood via cohesive WhatsApp channels that collectively reach a proportion of the neighbourhood vastly in excess of the old and fragmented CBCSI / CBW / street / sector WhatsApp and Telegram groups.
- 5.2.10. Communication of day-to-day successes on social media channels are growing in reach.
- 5.2.11. Traffic management plans.
- 5.2.12. Planning for festive season surge.
- 5.2.13. CCTV RFQ and roll-out.

## 6. Finance Presentation

6.1. The Treasurer, Richard Bendel, began his presentation at 19:17.

6.2. Significant topics covered included the following:

- 6.2.1. Financial governance.
- 6.2.2. Monthly management accounts and comparison of actual spend against budget.
- 6.2.3. Progressive Income & Expenditure Report.
- 6.2.4. Proposed Budget for 2025/2026.

Presentations referred to above can be found at:

<https://campsbaycid.org/wp-content/uploads/2024/10/Camps-Bay-CID-First-Members-Meeting-Presentation-20241023.pdf>

## 7. Voting

7.1. The Chairperson explained the voting process:

- 7.1.1. All members with voting rights were given a paddle with their member number on the face of the paddle.
- 7.1.2. Proxies are allowed and are also represented by paddles. Proxy holders need not be members. Attendees or members may therefore have more than one paddle to vote with if they have been given one or more proxies.
- 7.1.3. All votes will initially be decided by show of hands (i.e., paddles), with one vote per member in attendance or represented by proxy.
- 7.1.4. Circumstances where a formal poll can be called for were explained. Unless a poll is called for, the results of each vote will be declared by the Chairperson following a show of hands (i.e., paddles).

7.2. Administrative matters were voted on as follows, all of which were **approved by unanimous show of hands** with no votes against:

- 7.2.1. The Budget for 2025/26.
- 7.2.2. The Implementation Plan for 2025/26.
- 7.2.3. Cecil Kilpin appointed as the Company Auditor.
- 7.2.4. Richard Bendel confirmed as the Company Secretary.

7.3. Election of the Board of Directors

7.3.1. The following persons (all of whom were outgoing Directors who had been nominated for re-election) were **re-elected by unanimous show of hands** (in all cases more than 50 votes in favour with none against):

- 7.3.1.1. Spencer McNally
- 7.3.1.2. Louise Cooke
- 7.3.1.3. Richard Bendel
- 7.3.1.4. Kim Faclier

7.3.1.5. Gavin Reynolds

7.3.1.6. Martin Steinau

7.3.2. The following person (an outgoing Director who had been nominated for re-election) was **re-elected by overwhelming show of hands** (more than 50 votes in favour with one vote against):

7.3.2.1. Jonathan Tillet

7.3.3. The following person (who had not previously served as a Director and who was nominated for election) was **not elected by majority show of hands** (26 votes in favour, 42 votes against):

7.3.3.1. Chris von Ulmenstein

## 8. Questions & Answers

8.1. Questions received in advance of the meeting from Chris von Ulmenstein were addressed. Answers to these questions can be found in the presentation linked to above.

8.2. Additional questions were taken from the floor and responded to by Spencer McNally (Chairperson, SM) and Muneeb Hendricks (CID Manager, MH).

8.3. Alan Lighton (Central Drive) asked about the control room and how it operates as the one used by the CIDs in Hout Bay is very good.

8.3.1. SM confirmed that the Camps Bay CID has contracted with the same control room as used by the Hout Bay CIDs. Thus far the Board of Directors is very satisfied with the service that is being provided.

8.4. Sandra Hustwick (The Cheviots) raised concerns about the CID's plans for greenbelts. She emphasised the need to keep those areas clean and protect the natural plants and biodiversity, suggesting that the CID's plans would endanger such aims, particularly if the CID acted unilaterally.

8.4.1. SM pointed out that his presentation had made clear that relevant laws and procedures will be followed in the planning and execution of any CID work in the greenbelts.

8.4.2. SM emphasised that many of Camps Bay's green areas have been badly despoiled by illegal structures and their occupants cutting down indigenous trees and burning them, resulting in the CID having to put out fires in the greenbelts very regularly, often very close to local properties. Large amounts of litter also results from this and to date over 2,500 bags of rubbish have been removed from greenbelts.

8.4.3. SM pointed out that it is a mistake to simply see green bushes from the road as you drive past and naively assume that this means that there is biodiversity. The reality is that large tracts of Camps Bay's greenbelts are green on the outside and dead on the inside because much of the local fauna and flora is long gone or overwhelmed by invasive alien species. The removal of alien vegetation and re-planting of indigenous trees and plants at the privately-funded Shanklin Crescent Park (and the consequent recent return of porcupines after many years of absence, for example), is proof of what can be achieved if we rehabilitate these areas sensitively.

- 8.4.4. Rehabilitating our greenbelts is therefore necessary for both public safety and ecological reasons. To be effective and sustainable it must be done in a manner that reasonably balances both of these needs.
- 8.5. Sakumzi Macozoma (Fulham Road) said that he had travelled from Johannesburg for this meeting and when he arrived was disappointed to learn that he could not register as a member.
  - 8.5.1. SM explained that the MOI stipulates that prospective members must apply and be approved for membership by the Board of Directors in advance of the members' meeting in a formal process that includes checking the correctness of each application against the City of Cape Town's database of property owners. Unfortunately this means that membership applications cannot be accepted on the night.
  - 8.5.2. This is the reason why the CID sent multiple emails and WhatsApp messages over the past several weeks reminding property owners to register for membership and also why CID management had to invest so much time and effort into rectifying defective and incomplete applications in the week before the meeting.
- 8.6. Bernard Schäfer (Rottingdean Road) stated that he disagreed with the CID not having two-way WhatsApp groups to allow residents to communicate with each other in real-time during emergency situations. He furthermore stated that he expected that the reason why incident reports to the CID have doubled since a year ago (compared with incident reports to CBCSI, as reported by the CID Manager in his presentation) is because in the absence of two-way groups multiple people must be providing duplicate reports of the same incidents.
  - 8.6.1. SM corrected Bernard's unfounded assumption and pointed out that the statistics referred to by the CID Manager were in respect of unique incidents only.
  - 8.6.2. The CID has already advised that its one-way emergency alert groups can be opened for two-way communication and that this will be done as and when necessary.
  - 8.6.3. Outside of such circumstances it is plain that one-way groups are operationally far more effective and that an overwhelming majority of residents prefer to receive fewer rather than more messages.
- 8.7. Janine Lees (Finchley Road) raised concerns about traffic congestion over the summer season.
  - 8.7.1. MH responded that the CID's proposed traffic management plan has been submitted to the City of Cape Town for approval. Proposals include closing off certain roads during peak hours to guarantee emergency vehicle access, placing bollards to prevent illegal parking, and temporarily making certain roads one-way only to prevent congestion.
- 8.8. Ryan Paterson (Rontree Avenue) requested that when an issue or incident reported to the control room is resolved then feedback should be provided to the person who reported it.
  - 8.8.1. MH responded that this should already be happening for serious incidents.
  - 8.8.2. SM stated that the CID will ask the supplier of incident management software to develop a process to automate this for all incidents.

8.9. Bernard Schäfer (Rottingdean Road) asked whether there is a formal process for joining a sub-committee and/or evaluating the suitability of candidates.

8.9.1. SM responded that there is no formal process. If anyone would like to participate or nominate somebody else suitable then they should please contact Muneeb Hendricks.

8.9.2. Suitability of candidates will be evaluated by reference to the factors stated in SM's earlier presentation, i.e.:

8.9.2.1. Does the person have relevant and useful experience, skills and expertise?

8.9.2.2. Is the person able to contribute meaningful ongoing time and effort and be available to CID staff for advice and assistance when necessary?

8.9.2.3. Is the person able to work constructively with others, a particularly important factor for an NGO where decisions must be reached by collaboration and consensus?

8.9.2.4. Are their motives aligned with the CID? For example, CID sub-committees are not opportunities for commercial "networking" or social media "likes".

8.10. Michael Eastman (Kinnoull Road) asked if Law Enforcement Officers will be riding along in the response vehicles.

8.10.1. MH responded that this is the intention but consistent execution of this on every shift has been delayed by technicalities relating to the Law Enforcement Officers and City policies. CID Management hopes to resolve this soon.

9. In the absence of further questions, the meeting closed at 20:03

*Approval of Minutes, Duly Authorised by the Board of Directors of the Camps Bay CID NPC*

Signed by:



E6B3AA4790DD462...

Spencer McNally (Chairperson)