



Minutes of Second Public Meeting

Held at Camps Bay Primary School on 6 November 2023 at 18h00

1. Attendance by Steering Committee (SC) and Consultants

Steering Committee members in attendance:

- Spencer McNally (SM) (Steering Committee Chairperson)
- Richard Bendel
- Shayne Krige
- Theresa Massaglia
- Gavin Reynolds
- Jonathan Tillett

Steering Committee apologies:

- Louise Cooke
- Kim Faclier

Consultants to Steering Committee in attendance:

- Muneeb Hendricks
- Martin Steinau

2. Welcome

SM welcomed everyone to the meeting

3. CID Presentation

The Steering Committee's motivation for a CID and proposed plan and budget was presented in detail by SM.

A recording of the presentation and a copy of the slide show are available at www.campsbaycid.org.

4. Q&A

After the conclusion of the CID presentation, SM presented a number of questions that had been received prior to the meeting and gave answers. These questions and answers are set out in Appendix B.

Thereafter, questions and comments were received and answered as set out in Appendix A.

5. Closing

After allowing a reasonable amount of time to be sure that no further questions or comments were forthcoming, SM closed the meeting at 19h45 and invited the audience to join the Steering Committee for further conversation over sponsored cheese and wine.

Appendix A: Questions and Comments received at the meeting

Gary Benatar asked:

- Can the CID budget be changed after it has been approved?
- Will the City of Cape Town reduce basic services as a result of a CID?
- How will CCTV cameras be funded and will this replace patrols on the mountain edge?

SM answered as follows:

- The directors of the CID NPC can propose minor changes to the budget subsequent to approval, but any change will need to be approved by the City. Significant, material changes can otherwise happen if approved by 75% of the directors or 50.1% of property owners.
- The establishment of a CID will give our community the resources that are necessary to effectively monitor and manage the City's performance, thereby ensuring better basic service delivery. For example, employment of a CID Manager and other relevant staff will result in service delivery issues being reported faster than is currently the case, and will ensure that issues are followed up more frequently and diligently until they are resolved.
- SM elaborated on the details of camera expenditure and deployment. SM confirmed that residents who wished to continue utilizing additional security measures (such as guards) will be able to do so as the CID's proposed model allows for the continuation of existing "clip-on" schemes for specific roads or areas that wish to have them.

Lucie Martin thanked the committee for the presentation and hard work. This was met with applause from the audience. SM thanked Lucie for her kind words.

SM called for further questions and/or comments. A few minutes were allowed for people to come forward but none were forthcoming.

Appendix B: Questions received in advance of the meeting

Questions from First Public Meeting

Can the CID raise the percentage of your property's value that it adds to your monthly rates and taxes? If so, who will vote on this - all CB ratepayers or only the members of the Non-Profit Company?

Gerd Behrens

If the CID is approved, then the contribution rate is set for the first 5 years. Ordinarily, it can't be changed during the first 5 years.

There are two extraordinary mechanisms by which changes can be made

- a. Under the Companies Act, if 75% of the Directors vote in favour of a change
- b. Under the By-Law, if 50.1% of property owners vote in favour of a change

Towards the end of the 5 years, a new budget needs to be proposed. This will result in a new rate in the rand, and will depend on the services that the community wants to see then. The City will need to approve this new budget first. If they approve it, then it will go to a vote by the members of the NPC. Anybody who owns a property in Camps Bay that isn't exempt from rates can be a member of the NPC and can therefore vote on the new budget.

Questions from First Public Meeting

You said several times in the presentation that volunteers can't be relied upon, aren't sustainable, and eventually get burnt out.

You gave CBCSI and CBW as examples of where this has allegedly been proven true.

Why will it be different this time? If the directors of the CID NPC are going to be volunteers, then why won't they get burnt out?

Bernard Schaefer

CBCSI / CBW volunteers got burnt out because not enough money was raised to perform the necessary functions or provide the necessary services. It's very stressful when you know that you don't have the resources to do the job properly. Also, they had to do everything themselves, in their spare time, with virtually no support and they were a very small group, not nearly enough people, carrying a very large load. Over time, the stress of all of that becomes overwhelming

In contrast, the CID:

- will have a substantial budget, enough to do what it needs to do
- will employ professional contractors to do what needs to be done
- and will employ a full-time staff to manage everything

So after everything is up and running the directors might meet once a month, and probably have to take a few phone calls inbetween, but there's no reliance on volunteers on a day-to-day basis

All of that means that being a volunteer director becomes a much less onerous responsibility, much less stressful, therefore no burn out.

There are other places where we have already seen this work very well.

SM has been a trustee of the Red Cross Children's Hospital Trust (CHT) since 2009. The CHT has raised more than R1bn for the Red Cross Children's Hospital and for paediatric healthcare in the Western Cape and has managed massive construction projects with annual budgets many multiples of the proposed Camps Bay CID.

All of the CHT trustees are volunteers, some of them have been doing it for 25 years, none of them are burnt out. Why is this? Because the trustees do have serious responsibilities, but management does all of the day-to-day work

In other words, the proposed Camps Bay CID structure is built on a model that works very well for much bigger organizations and no doubt it will work fine for us.

Questions from First Public Meeting

There is no mention of CID mandate covering irresponsible property development against Camps Bay guidelines. How will the CID work with CB & Clifton Ratepayers Association that has been doing great work in preserving and defending owners rights in respect of irresponsible development in the neighbourhood?

Greg Walsh

Other than enforcing by-laws (which includes conduct on building sites, such as acceptable working hours) a CID's mandate only extends to public spaces, not private property

So property development and whether it's responsible or not is not a CID's mandate

CBCRA will therefore remain the primary entity that deals with this.

Questions from Consultation Phase

The Levy for the initiative is pretty high, and more than double what I recall being discussed previously. That's a grudge purchase, given that my rates and taxes should fund this.

Can we slash the costs in half and proceed with a more affordable solution?

Joshua Mentz

August 26

This question is presented along with related correspondence so that everyone can see the approach that the Steering Committee (SC) took during the Consultation Phase, in particular the extent to which the SC gave everyone ample opportunity to query and debate the questions and issues that mattered to them.

The SC has lots of sympathy for this viewpoint, but the SC's job is to find ways to provide the outcomes that the community needs, and the budget is determined by that. You have to start with the desired services, and then work out the budget from there, not the other way around.

So the only way to adjust the budget is either to find ways of providing the same services for less, or to deliver the same result with different services.

Both of those are very hard to do. The SC spoke to a lot of people when we came up with the costs and overall we believe that the proposed plan is as realistic as possible in the circumstances.

Questions from Consultation Phase

The short answer is that while we could of course reduce the budget, doing so would not be optimal, and would result in substantially less effective outcomes, particularly for public safety and dealing with homelessness / vagrancy / illegal structures.

If you're interested in some of the detail, then please consider the following, with particular reference to some of the most cost-intensive components of the budget:

1. Law Enforcement Officers (LEOs) are an absolute must. Without them, we would not have power of arrest, which is crucial for dealing promptly with (for example) the building of illegal structures. In case you didn't know, the law says that once the roof is on a structure, however ramshackle, then the occupant cannot be evicted, hence speed is often of the essence. Given your location at the top of the Little Glen green belt, we're sure that you appreciate the importance of this.

....

*Response to
Joshua Mentz*

August 31

So in this case we replied to Joshua with a long answer about why the costs are at the level that we have proposed and gave Joshua an opportunity to tell us how we should do anything differently. This is a brief extract from the response

It was a very long email, this only shows one item on the list. There were 7 in total, with all of the SC's responses set out in at least similar detail.

Questions from Consultation Phase

I appreciate the response. I do still feel that the cost is double what I would consider reasonable (after my this year's re-valuation of my house). The proposal seems pretty lavish, and there seems to be plenty of fat which can be trimmed down. I'd be happy to provide suggestions on specifics if that would be useful.

Joshua Mentz

August 31

Joshua replied the same day, reiterating that he thinks that the proposal is lavish and says that he will be happy to send specific suggestions.

Questions from Consultation Phase

>>

The proposal seems pretty lavish, and there seems to be plenty of fat which can be trimmed down. I'd be happy to provide suggestions on specifics if that would be useful.

<<

Most suburbs with CIDs fall into one of two categories: either they have serious crime problems (burglary, robbery, home invasions, etc ... eg Hout Bay), or they suffer the side-effects of our nation's social problems (vagrancy, begging, homelessness, illegal structures, petty street crime ... eg Green Point, City of Cape Town).

Our problem in Camps Bay is that we have both of those issues, and on a scale that places us at the upper end of severity for both of them relative to other suburbs. Our homes are very attractive targets for criminals (hence the very active nightcrawlers, etc) and our beachfront is extremely attractive for vagrants and homeless people looking for easy targets (whether in the form of space for illegal shelters, or for begging and petty theft).

....

Nonetheless, we're happy to consider any and all suggestions, so if you have something specific in mind that you think should change or go then please let us know.

*Response to
Joshua Mentz*

August 31

However there weren't any suggestions in Joshua's email, so the SC replied to him on the same day, again with a fair amount of detail to explain why we disagree, why we don't think that our business plan is lavish, and why we think that it's appropriate

Again this does not show the entire response as there isn't space for all of it.

The response concluded with a request for Joshua to share his suggestions

Questions from Consultation Phase

So strip out all of the unrelated functions that the residents aren't asking for: Cleansing services? Just help Chris pay for Joy's retainer. Environmental development and urban maintenance? I personally take care of the Little Glen, and lobby COCT when I need help. We get by OK already. Social and economic development? Nobody is asking the CID to solve all of our society's problems.

Joshua Mentz

September 5

This was Joshua's response, a few days later, in which he states his belief that residents aren't really asking for all the things that the SC is proposing.

Questions from Consultation Phase

>>
So strip out all of the unrelated functions that the residents aren't asking for.
<<

It is incorrect to say that residents aren't asking for any services beyond Public Safety.

In the Urban Management Survey (UMS), significant majorities of residents expressed concerns relating to homelessness and related social problems (93%) and cleansing and related issues (71%), and stated that they would like to see improvements in parks and open spaces (68%).

This is reinforced by the fact that more than 80% of people who have responded to our surveys and feedback requests say that they are in favour of the CID proposals, with thus far only around 7% against.

It is also incorrect to state that the other services are "unrelated". They are all in fact deeply intertwined with, and very much necessary for, overall public safety.

....

*Response to
Joshua Mentz*

September 7

The SC responded again, explaining why we believe that he is wrong, not least because the UMS shows that that residents and property owners are in fact asking for all of the things that he thinks that they aren't

Once again the SC gave a LOT more detail that is not shown above. This response was a VERY long email.

Questions from Consultation Phase

I've heard that the Camps Bay CID business plan is being revised. Just a note that I am supportive of this CID iff the cost gets slashed in half.
Thanks,
Joshua

Joshua Mentz

October 20

Joshua did not reply again until about 6 weeks later, when this email was received

As you can hopefully see from all of the above, this is why the CID SC has been working nights and weekends. Most of the comments received during this process have required very detailed responses, and several of them went for a few rounds, back and forth like this one did.

The most important thing to see here is that the SC didn't just dismiss anyone

The SC replied to everyone, engaged on the substance, gave people every chance to be heard and to give workable alternatives

Questions from Consultation Phase

Why did the Steering Committee not respond to the questions that were asked on all the neighbourhood Facebook and WhatsApp and Telegram groups?



This wasn't a specific question, but the SC did take a bit of flak on a few social media groups, for not engaging on those groups, so the SC thought that we should explain why we didn't engage on social media.

Number one, the SC just doesn't have the resources for this. Social media is 24/7, people want immediate responses, but the Steering Committee are all volunteers, already working nights and weekends on the CID and we simply don't have time to deal with social media also

Number two, the reach is poor. There are lots of community WhatsApp / Telegram groups, generally they are fragmented and small, and not many of our residents are active on Facebook, so it would have been a lot of effort for not a lot of return

Number three, replies just get lost in the noise, with all the replies to replies, and all the arguing and the debate. And when there are 173 unread messages on a group, then people just zone out and skip over or mark them all as read. So again a waste of time and effort.

Number four, there's no audit trail, which is particularly important for the Consultation Phase where we needed to be able to show the City all comments and all responses. It's impossible to keep proper track of all of that on WhatsApp or Telegram or Facebook.

Lastly, a lot of what happens on social media just seems to be controversy for its own sake, and some of it really is nonsense. Some people love attention, and making up stuff and shouting at other people is a great way to get attention. If you want to shout at us, come to one of our meetings or come and meet with us. We're happy to be shouted at in person, but we don't have time to be shouted at on social media. People are welcome to do that, but we can't respond to them there.

Questions from Consultation Phase

CID establishment funding – normally at-risk donors/funders can claim these startup funds back once CID established. I cannot see where the allowance for the repayment for this debt has been reflected.

Bernard Schäfer

All of the costs of setting up a CID need to be paid from somewhere. In our case that' the salaries of our consultants, the cost of our web site and database software, flyers, postage, and so on

Usually the people on the Steering Committee "lend" that money to the CID, and then if the CID gets approved they get repaid

In our case, we went out to donors before we started, and we asked for donations. We were very lucky, about 20 people agreed to donate very generous amounts of money, including a couple of people on the Steering Committee.

So with our CID there's nothing to repay. All of the setup costs so far have been covered by donations.

Questions from Consultation Phase

24. Gated road ends leading onto public open spaces must be opened for pedestrians during the day. This is not the case. There are several gatekeepers who have locked and barricaded access from the roads to the public open spaces. This impacts on the most vulnerable of society - pedestrians – those without cars who are walking through these areas.

Sandra Hustwick

This was a good point, so we've inserted a line in the Business Plan to confirm that the CID Public Safety team will take responsibility for these gates

Questions from Consultation Phase

1) As your presentation shows, we have a very high (and very varied) amount of open and green space within and bordering on our neighbourhood. While your stated goals for upgrading are wonderful, I think an opportunity would be missed if you (we?) didn't commission an overall open space plan for the area under CID care - a strategic framework that will guide the planning and implementation of smaller projects over a longer period. It should also create an action plan to help identify areas where pressure can be brought on the City to collaborate on/fund neighbourhood projects, and what the correct department/programme in the City is to target for the work (eg. Coastal Management for the recreation area around the tidal pool; Biodiversity Management for clearing alien vegetation, etc. etc).

Simone Lilienfeld

This was a very constructive submission regarding Environmental Upgrading from somebody who has a Masters in City & Regional Planning and work experience in the field.

Basically the idea is to get suitable experts to guide us in how we go about upgrading and maintain green spaces, and then to help us project manage that, so this is another thing that we've built into the Business Plan

We did go and get a quote for this. We're too scared to say how much they quoted, we can't afford that much, but we've budgeted R200,000 for it and Simone has offered her time as well, and we also have some other volunteers who have offered to assist

Questions from Consultation Phase

2) My second item ideally falls under the first, but I think it is important enough as a stand-alone point. I hope that the CID will fund/coordinate the restoration of the natural environment of the Little Glen/Blinkwater waterway, create a security system (cameras?) above the Scout huts, and coordinate and help fund creating a path between Camps Bay Drive and the top of the building line, so that one can follow the Blinkwater stream from the tidal pool up to the Pipe Track and walk from there up to the top of the mountain.

Simone Lilienfeld

Simone's second point was also a good one. We can't promise that we will be able to get this done, but we think that it's a good idea, and it's exactly the kind of thing that we do want to do to make Camps Bay safer and to enhance value for property owners and residents

Plus it's great to see that people with the right kind of experience and expertise support what we want to do and are prepared to help out

So we'll look a bit closer at this in due course

Questions from Consultation Phase

a CID is fully controlled by the City, at least the City has the final say in almost everything (see City Improvement District By-Law, 2023). The members have a very limited say. The City of Cape Town so far was not in a position to address the problems of our community, if it was, there would be no need for a CID. And now you want to give the City a say over additional funds ?

Will it not be better to strengthen the existing CIS (Community Safety Initiative) or the like ? At least the members decide where the money goes by themselves.

Torsten Orendt

The first statement here is not correct. Yes, the City does have oversight, but property owners approve the budget, property owners can elect or change the directors, and the directors make the day-to-day decisions of what gets fixed and when, where the public safety team focuses, where the cameras get installed, and so on and so on. So the City's control is really about governance, whereas the directors and therefore the property owners control the implementation and the operations.

On the second point, this is moot as it's too late now, the time to strengthen CBCSI was a few years ago.

We've heard people say things like, "well, if only they had tried harder to raise more money". CBCSI tried a lot of things in this regard. For example, somebody was employed to call every single person who called WatchCon to report an incident and who wasn't a contributor. These are people who knew all about CBCSI, in some cases CBCSI resources were sent to their house to help them out. This person phoned and emailed and WhatsApp'ed them all several times. Anybody want to guess what percentage of those people said sure, I'll give you R395 a month?
Answer: not even 10%

So we're sorry, but it's too late for CBCSI

Questions for Second Meeting

My question for the 6 Nov meeting:
I believe it's best to get as many contributing landlords. Thus, is it not better to start smaller, thus cheaper to join and more landlords join, then show success and grow from there?

Alex Brownlee

This is a variation on an earlier theme (and I think that when Alex says landlords she means property owners)

The simple answer is that the law doesn't allow this, so we can't do it, even if we think that it's a good idea

The relevant legislation and by-laws basically say that we're all in or we're all out

There's no halfway, no starting small and then expanding from there

We either do everything or we don't do anything

Questions for Second Meeting

How can a tenant who isnt a property owner able to help contribute to the budget?

Kalden Swart

This one is easy ... tell your landlord to vote yes!

After that, it's pretty likely that he or she is going to push up your rent, so you'll end up contributing that way

Questions for Second Meeting

Thank you for the opportunity to raise this issue. We have two estate agency boards erected on our intersection on the corners of The Cheviots and Eldon Lane in Camps Bay. One is an advertisement, and the other is a 'Sold' sign that's been left on display for many months. Both are installed on solid metal poles, and seem quite permanent. Please see attached PDF for reference.

Do either of these prominently installed metal signs contravene any bylaws? If so, what should be done to remove them?

Mark Taylor

Mark's email went on to give details of how long the signs had been displayed for. It sounds like they've been there for longer than they should have been, and if they're on public property (which isn't quite obvious from the question) then maybe they shouldn't have been allowed to be there at all

Nonetheless, this will be covered by the by-laws, so if anybody is placing signs where they shouldn't, or displaying them for longer than allowed, then you'll be able to report that and the CID's Law Enforcement officers will come and enforce the by-laws as necessary.

Questions for Second Meeting

Q1: Do businesses (beach front) pay more towards the cost of the CID?

Q2: As the biggest issue we have in Camps Bay, I believe more than break-ins are people and their disruptive and inconsiderate behaviour, during summer the main problem area is the beach front and alcohol consumption.

If the answer to Q1 is yes and due to the beachfront being the more problematic area, does this mean that the rest of Camps Bay (far away from the beach front) will be neglected in case of a complaint requiring a timeously intervention?

Michael Breakey

Question 1: Commercial properties pay a higher rate in the Rand

Question 2: No area of Camps Bay automatically gets priority over another, and you're not going to get better service from the CID if your house is worth more than somebody else's. The CID will deal with all incidents on a case-by-case basis and will prioritize in a way that we're sure everyone will agree on

So for example, anything life-threatening obviously comes first. With three 24/7 TAC vehicles and two 24/7 LE officers the CID should be able to handle a few things at the same time before we have to start deciding what has to wait while we do something else first

But how much you pay towards the CID is not going to factor into the decision

Questions for Second Meeting

Q3: What is the CID stance and authority with closing down/dealing with party houses?

Michael Breakey

Excessive and disturbing noise pollution, naturally concentrated in the strip, even up to the early hours of the morning. This is drastically changing the nature of the area enjoyed by all residents and visitors to Cape Town. It is a family area, but maybe not for much longer.

Steven Caldis

There are by-laws that govern noise pollution and noise nuisance. They might be slightly different for residential properties compared with commercial ones, but the principle will be the same

The CID's LE officers are there to enforce the by-laws, and that applies whether it's people getting drunk or violent on the beach, or making unreasonable noise at a "party house" or a commercial business doing anything that goes beyond what it's legally allowed to do

If you think that anyone is doing something against the law or against any of the by-laws then you can report it, and Law Enforcement will go and have a look and take appropriate action if necessary

Questions for Second Meeting

My question is how am I going to vote on one form for both houses bcos I was told that I'll get two votes & wondering how it will be counted.

Karl Roduner

Yes, you will get two votes if you are paying rates for two properties

All you have to do is list the erf numbers for both properties on the form, the City will count that as two votes

Questions for Second Meeting

3. Why not give all pensioners a rebate whether legible or not . CID can decide this on their own. There is no valid reason not to make that offer. Do not push everything on Municipality bcos you cld recurse all senior citizen who owns property from yr system. There's no excuse.

Karl Roduner

The CID doesn't collect the CID levies, the City does

So the CID doesn't have the ability to exempt anybody from paying, and the CID doesn't have the ability to give rebates, only the City can do that

Also, for obvious reasons, the law doesn't allow the CID to give money back to residents

Questions for Second Meeting

I read that you made some offer to senior citizens who contacted you. So what is the offer or rebate or offer of CID? Someone mentioned a reverse mortgage? Is that really it!

Karl Roduner

Yes, it is a reverse mortgage, please come and discuss if you want more detail

The SC believes that it's a good option, but of course it's up to every individual to consider and decide for themselves

Questions for Second Meeting

Hi. I'm sorry this late. My question is: how will the CID improve security along the border with TM National Park and the adjacent vacant land?

Anthea van Wieringen

As discussed in the presentation, the plan is to have cameras all along the edges, including thermal where it makes sense, so that we can see people moving in or out of those greenbelts

We'll also be looking at drones, and with three 24/7 tactical response vehicles we'll have 3x the response capability that CBCSI has now

Questions for Second Meeting

I live in Camps bay Glenn and am super worried about the homeless structures that are set up and the increase of crime.

My question is, is it possible to registrate all green belts and beaches between cpt and Houtbaai as "Nature reserve with critical endangered flora (fynbosch) that gives law enforcement more rights to clear illegal structures?

Arnie van Opstal

When it comes to public spaces, there isn't anywhere that Law Enforcement can't go within our CID area, and the conservation status of the land doesn't make any difference to their powers, they're equally strong regardless

Questions for Second Meeting

6. What happens to our local street camera project? Do we continue to pay a separate fee for monitoring and analytics?

Fazila Moolla

The aim is for these to be absorbed into the CID infrastructure, including the monitoring cost getting taken over by the CID, but it does depend on how your scheme has been set up and whether or not you and your neighbours want to hand over control of it

If you and they do then a few minor details might need to change, but we will work that all out and we will come and discuss the options with each of the clip-on schemes in due course

Questions for Second Meeting

If there is insufficient support for the formation a CID, what will the next step be?

Fazila Moolla

If the CID fails then once CBCSI is gone by the middle of next year then it will be everyone for themselves

Even the clip-on camera and guard schemes will have to go it alone because without CBCSI there won't be a WatchCon and there won't be a TAC1